

The Influences of Music Teachers on a Person's Musical Development: In the Context of Lifelong Music Learning

Eun-Jung Lim *

The purpose of this research was to explore the influences of music teachers during school years on a person's musical development in terms of continuous education. In order to do this, this research was conducted with the multiple case study of six seniors that offered narrative data of their personal music experiences during school years and afterward. It was found from this research that school music teachers have a significant influence not only on a person's musical development but on human development throughout life. Findings suggested that, to make positive influences on students' musical development, music teachers should build a close relationship with students, cultivate a positive attitude toward music, use various instruction methods for students' full sensual enjoyment of music, and develop an open music curriculum to meet students' various musical needs.

※ Key words: music teachers, music experiences, musical development, lifelong music learning

Table of Contents

- I . Introduction
- II . Purpose Statement and Research Questions
- III . Research Method
- IV . Seniors' Narratives of Music Teachers
- V . Data Analysis
- VI . Conclusion: Suggestions for Music Teachers

* 경희대학교, 광주교육대학교 강사

I . Introduction

In the studies of music education, many researches have taken advantage of the notion of experience. They have viewed music education as experience and described it as a continuous process of a person's perceptual and emotional interaction with musical and educational environments to which a person has been exposed. Most of those researches have shared the idea that music experience from the earlier stages of learning process has a significant influence on a person's musical development throughout life (Cohen & Clyburn, 1996; Gabrielsson, 2002; Sloboda & O'Neill, 2001). Recent researches have focused on music education during school years and its effects on shaping and developing a student's musical consciousness, perception, sensitivity, or preference throughout life (Arasi, 2006; Rohwer, 2002). Most of them have laid their critical eyes on music teachers and their significant influences on a student's musical development and future musical pursuits (Brand, 1985; Creech & Hallam, 2003; Davidson, Sloboda, & Howe, 1995; Lowe, 2012; Madsen & Kelly, 2002; Sichivitsa, 2007). A lots of studies on the influence of music education and music teachers on a person's music development, however, have explored it in terms of school education rather than continuous education. Hence it is needed to view music education as experience, to place it in a lifelong process of learning or doing music, and then, from this view, to reconsider the influences of music teachers on a person's musical development.

II . Purpose Statement and Research Questions

This research explored how music teachers have influences on a person's musical development and lifelong pursuit for music by looking at music experiences of seniors who got the K-12 education at earlier stages of learning process. It aimed to offer some practical suggestions for school music

education and music teachers. To do this, it included three main research questions:

1. What specific kinds of music experiences they recall during school years, both in-school and out-of-school?
2. Do they recall any music teacher in that period? If any, how they describe about the experience with the teacher? Is it positive or negative?
3. How they reflect on music teachers and their influences on the lifelong pursuits for music?

III. Research Method

1. Theoretical Framework

The basic understanding of music education in this research is grounded on Dewey's (1938/1998) idea of education as experience—the free interaction of human individuals with surrounding conditions at every stage of learning process. According to Dewey's idea, a person is constantly interacting with cultural conditions and such interaction takes place not only at earlier stages of school education but at later stages of continuous education. In this sense, music education can be also described in terms of experience: the constant interaction of a person with cultural conditions at every stage of learning music. It involves a person's intellectual, emotional, or physical response to musical conditions—the music, the human, and the situation.

2. Research Design

Due to the fact that experience is intrinsically narrative in quality, this research was basically framed with the method of case study that could involve in personal narrative, autobiographical memory, life history, and story-telling (Brewer, 1996; Conway & Pleydell-Pearce, 2000; Hatch &

Wisniewski, 1995). The case study method, however, might expose a methodological weakness in terms of the truthfulness: research participants cannot narrate all the incidents in the past due to memory ability, or may filter out some incidents according to their emotional reaction to them (Cary, 1999). To minimize this weakness, this research used the event history calendar that could provide sequential and parallel retrieval within the structure of the personal, autobiographical memory (Belli, 1998). Also, it adopted the cross-case method—the mixture of single and multiple case study: each case was treated at first as a single case in its totality and then assorted into an incorporated group in order to find common features of all cases. With these qualitative methods, this research could achieve objective truthfulness by treating each narrative as an independent case in a particular situation and provide a contextual understanding of music experience by placing all the narratives as a collective case within a historical situation.

3. Participants

For participant recruitment, there were three conditions: (i) those who were older than the age of 55; (ii) those who had K-12 school experiences in the United States.; and (iii) those who had never worked as music professionals. Through convenience sampling (Gay, Mills, & Airasian, 2006), the researcher initially recruited nine seniors who met these conditions and selected six out of them by considering how much amount of their narrative data related to music education and teachers. Betty (pseudonym), a 71-year-old female, attended private Catholic schools in Ohio from elementary to high school. Henry (pseudonym), a 64-year-old male, emigrated from Germany to the U.S. and attended schools in Ohio and New York in the period of K-12. All other participants learned music from public schools and others local institutions during school years: George (pseudonym), a 61-year-old male, spent his K-12 years in Tennessee; Jack (pseudonym), a 57-year-old male, in Ohio; Julia (pseudonym), a 63 year-old female, in Ohio; and Peggy (pseudonym), a 75-year-old female, in West Virginia and Ohio.

4. Data Collection and Procedures

This research collected narrative data of music experience from three sources: individual and group interviews with six participants, journal writings by the participants, and field notes by the researcher. It conducted individual interviews with six research participants in open-ended questionnaires, set for narrating their personal stories related to music, teachers, and education from their own past. At the end of interview process, it carried out a group interview with all participants to collect more coherent data about each case by sharing their personal music experiences with other participants. All participants were asked to write a journal, describing freely any other musical incidents that were missed or neglected during interviews. In both interviews and journal writings, all participants were also asked to make their own reflections on or evaluations of those music experiences. Throughout the period of data collection, field notes were kept by the researcher to record on-the-spot ideas or background information about participants and their music experiences. These field notes worked as an effective resource for modifying interview questionnaires and analyzing data sources.

After collecting data, this research looked over each case as a personal narrative first, and then reviewed all the cases as a group narrative of music experience. For this cross-case analysis, this research classified all the musical incidents into three main codes—human factors, music activities and physical environments, all of which assorted again several subcodes.

<Table 1> Description of Codes during School Years

	Main Codes	Subcodes	Descriptions of Codes
In-Schools	Human Factors	Teachers	school music teachers for music classes, extracurricular, and club activities
		Friends	someone who shared music or did musical activities together in schools
	Music Activities	Music Class Activities	music activities in music classes
		Music Club Activities	music activities with participating music club activities
		Field Trips	field trips related to music as extracurricular activities
		School Events	school events related to music as extracurricular activities in schools

	Main Codes	Subcodes	Descriptions of Codes
Out-of-School	Human Factors	Family	parents, siblings, or relatives; or music activities with parents, siblings, or relatives
		Friends	someone who shared music or did music activities together after school
		Private Music Teachers	music teachers who taught in private music lesson or religious music activities
	Music Activities	Private Music Lessons	music activities through private music lessons
		Religious Music Activities	personal or group music activities in churches
		Self-training of Music	learning music instrument by oneself
		Music Concert Goings	attending music concerts or festivals
	Physical environments	Music Instruments	all kinds of media or music instruments used for music enjoyments such as radio, audio player, TV, piano, etc.
		Media	

In analyzing data sources, this research used the qualitative data analysis software of *NVIVO 8*, with which it presented common factors across all cases as well as particular issues of each case. The value of each code and subcode was determined to reflect the frequency and intensity of relevant incidents, that is to say, how many times those incidents referred as an important experience.

5. Validity and Reliability Test

Since it dealt with different data sources from interviews, journals writings, and field notes, this research employed the techniques of triangulation, member checking, and peer review to test validity and reliability of data. In the process of triangulation, all the data sources were compared with one another to cross-check data validity from multiple sources. Member checking eliminated any potential bias on the part of the researcher: once summarizing narrative data from interviews and journal writings, the researcher asked all six

participants to review the summary drafts and to give their feedbacks, in the process of which participants corrected some interpretation errors, clarified what they wanted to tell, or sometimes commented on this research itself. Lastly, peer reviews provided the reliability of data analysis and results: this research employed two doctoral students who were majoring in music education and well-versed in qualitative study and code analysis. This research got some critical own reviews or comments on initial codes from the peers and modified some of the codes based on their reviews.

6. Limitations of the Study

This research imposes three limitations of data accuracy, explanatory certainty, and contextual interpretation. This research relied primarily upon narrative data from seniors' memories, which might be filtered, affected, and even distorted by their recollection capabilities, selective recollection retrieval, or linguistic abilities. By using qualitative methods for the most part, this research might fail to provide a logical explanation about the relation between quantitative amount of music experience and the qualitative degree of its influences on personal music development. Also, since it focused on seniors' personal narratives of music teacher and education, this research gave less attention to their cultural backgrounds such as class, race, gender, and ethnicity which might be of great importance to their musical development.

IV. Seniors' Narratives of Music Teachers

All the six cases provided their own narratives of and reflections on music, education, and teachers during school years and afterward. They revealed the influences of those experiences on their musical developments at later stages of learning process. Below are the summaries of six cases.

Betty

As spending her K-12 years in Catholic schools, Betty remembered a couple of nuns who did music activities together: one was a director of girls' choir at church and the other a private tutor for piano lesson. She enjoyed the choir activities of listening and singing spiritual songs and trained from the director how to arrange music pieces for choral performance. She learned also from the piano tutor how to read music and play piano. Though she could not get sufficient musical knowledge and skills from those experiences, Betty remembered those nuns as generous teachers as well as good musicians. She said those experiences of church music with the teachers had positively affected on her attitude toward music and enriched her life after graduation.

Jack

Jack remembered a music teacher from his elementary school who strongly encouraged him to take part in musical activities and motivated him to continue musical pursuits. In the very first class, he was asked what his favorite instruments were. He was then helped to practice his favorite instruments such as drum, guitar, and piano and urged to try other instruments in the classroom. He was introduced various music genres from classical to pop-music and diverse ethnic music from Germany, Russian, and other nationals. He remembered the teacher's personality as being friendly and patient with him in teaching how to read musical notes and how to play other untried instruments. Jack admitted that he was very lucky to meet the teacher; music experience with the teacher at the very early stage of learning process had had a great influence on his musical sensitivity and knowledge and made him open-minded and optimistic.

Julia

Julia remembered a music teacher who encouraged her to take part in a music competition in her eighth grade from junior high school. When asked first, she was unwilling to try out for it because she could not play any musical instrument and could not read musical notes. In addition, she was

very shy due to her learning disability. However, as encouraged again and again, she made a decision to participate the competition. With some assistance from the teacher, she composed a song with simple melodies and lyrics, with which she eventually won the competition. From this musical accomplishment, Julia could overcome her severe shyness and became more confident in herself as well as in music than before.

George

George recalled a music teacher from high school who acknowledged his musical potentials and guided to join in choir activities. There were two different sections in music class: choir activities and composition works. Because of his shyness, George chose the composition section, in which he used to write musical notes. One day he sat at the corner of classroom and wrote musical notes humming a song that had been recently rehearsed by the choir. He was asked by the teacher, interested by his humming, to join the choir. George started choir activities and performed a first tenor. He enjoyed the choir activities so much that he practiced five days a week. During choir activities, he also learned about other genres such as blues or jazz, which led him to new musical challenges. Though too shy to take part in other types of group activities, George could get self-confidence and improve social skills as well as developing his musical appreciation and sensibility from choir activities.

Henry

Henry's story about music teachers provides a good instance of the fact that they can have an influence not only in a positive way but in a negative way on a person's musical development. At his second grade, Henry emigrated into the U.S. from Germany and got a public education in Ohio and New York until the twelfth grade. As learning music in class, he faced some kinds of cultural troubles: the linguistic difficulty in speaking English and the educational differences between the two nations—educational methods, manners, and ethics. His negative experience of music teacher was related to these cultural and linguistic troubles. Henry remembered a music teacher in his sixth

grade who did not allow him to participate in a music talent show at school due to his incorrect accent. He got a positive experience of music education from his high school years when he met a teacher who had a good attitude toward students as well as music. He was most impressed when the teacher showed sincere respect for students in class. He was then motivated by the teacher's education goal, teaching style and instruction structure. He could revive his interest in music as the teacher encouraged him to take part in music activities, introduced various genres from classical opera to ethnic music, including American folks. With those experiences, Henry changed his view of music and education more positively than before and became acknowledged the considerable cultural diversity.

Peggy

Peggy's story about music teachers showed that a private tutor could have an influence on a person's musical development. As asked about personal experiences of music teacher, Peggy talked about a private tutor for piano lesson from the fifth to the sixth grade in which she learned how to read musical notes and play them. She was taught a variety of classical music, from traditional to contemporary works, and got informed of cultural contexts of the works, the historical backgrounds, or the personal lives of prominent composers. She had enjoyed every lesson until her family moved out of Virginia to Ohio. Her experience of learning music with the tutor helped her have a confidence in music and motivate to continue her later musical pursuits.

V. Data Analysis

The values of major codes across all cases indicate that, when recalling experiences of music in their lives, seniors referred music experiences during school years (79.5%) more frequently than those of postschool years (20.5%). During school years, the total value of in-school music experience (32.3%) is

less than that of out-of-school music experiences (47.2%). Among major codes of music experience during school years, the highest value is given to the code of human factors (34.4%): family members, teachers, and friends. Of these human factors, the code of music teachers (8.5%) has the highest value next to that of family members. As recalling music teachers during school years, seniors in most cases talked about school teachers (94.1%) more frequently than out-of-school teachers (5.9%). They also tended to remember music teachers in positive (91.2%) rather than negative.

From data analysis, it is assumed that the experiences at the earlier stage of learning music account for most of music experiences in a person's life; those experiences of learning music during that period take place both in school and out of school as well; humans are the most important factor to define a person's music experience; and music teachers have a significant influence on a person's musical development.

<Table 2> Code Values of Teachers during School Years

Category	Main Codes	Coverage 100%	Subcodes		Coverage 100%
In-school	Teachers in music classes	85.9%	regular music classes	positive	67.1%
				negative	18.8%
	Teachers in extracurricular	8.2%	music club activities	positive	8.2%
				negative	0.0%
Out-of-school	Teachers in out-of-school	5.9%	private music lesson, religious activities	positive	5.9%
				negative	0.0%

As detailed above, music teachers at the stage of school education could make a lifelong impact on a person's musical development and human development as well. The seniors' narratives showed that music teachers during school years could stimulate students' musical interests, advance their musical awareness, enhance their musical skills and knowledge, or develop their confidence in music. Most interestingly, when remembering a music

teacher, participants frequently brought up a teacher's personal character to communicate with students, a teacher's attitude toward music, or a teacher's instruction methods rather than teaching contents. They were more likely to remember a music teacher who had enthusiasm for music and education than those who had considerable knowledge of or skills in music. From every practice in class activities, they were sensitively aware of a teacher's passion or concerns for music, class, and students. They had developed their own attitudes toward music through emotional interactions with teachers. In most cases, they preferred music teachers who taught music with a variety of instruction methods to those who with a formal, uniformed method.

VI. Conclusion: Suggestions for Music Teachers

This research investigated a person's experience of music, education, and teachers during school years and examined its influences on a person's musical development throughout entire life. It was conducted with six senior participants who provided their own narratives of music teachers via interviews and journal writings. Research results indicated that a music teacher is one of the important factors in defining students' music experiences during school years and beyond: in cultivating students' musical attitudes, in developing their musical sensibilities, and in enhancing their musical knowledge. It was concluded that a music teacher has profound influences on a person's musical development not only at earlier stages of school education but in the lifelong process of learning music. From these results, some constructive suggestions could be offered for school music education and teacher: to build a close relationship with students; to cultivate positive attitude toward music; to do music with diverse instruction methods; and to develop an open music curriculum.

1. Building a Close Relationship with Students

First of all, a music teacher should make a close relationship with students. Most senior participants in this research remembered those moments as impressive when a teacher showed respect for them, expressed sympathy with their troubles relating to music, or encouraged them to participate in various musical activities. Most interestingly, they were seldom moved by a teacher's musical knowledge or playing skills, but rather by a teacher's emotional attitudes toward music and students. In this sense, a music teacher should enhance sympathetic communication with students, pay attention to their emotional expressions, and give responsive feedbacks to students. A music teacher can enhance the intimate relationship with students by sharing his/her personal music experiences with them.

2. Cultivating Positive Attitude toward Music

Another suggestion of this research involves in the fact that a teacher's attitude toward music can determine the levels of students' motivation and involvement in music. When doing music in class, a teacher should realize that positive attitude toward music is far more important than musical knowledge or skills. As shown in this research, the research participants could intuitively feel a teacher's attitude toward music from seeing teacher's various expressive behaviors such as facial expression, body movement, voice tone, eye contact, and other expressive manners. Hence a music teacher should keep in mind that students could do music in class not only from learning knowledge or skills of music but from feeling a good attitude toward music.

3. Teaching Music with Diverse Instruction Methods

A music teacher should develop diverse instruction methods to make students feel music rather than merely know it. In many cases in this study, senior participants used to do music without any knowledge of write or read

musical notes. During school years, they learned more by enjoying music using all sense organs than by solely storing up musical knowledge in the brain. In addition to musical activities of singing, playing, or listening, they also enjoyed music from musical spectacles of concert halls, grand auditoriums, musical theatres, or music concerts. Therefore, when planning music class, a music teacher should develop teaching methods for exiting other sense organs as well as auditory one.

4. Developing an Open Music Curriculum

A music teacher should also develop an open curriculum that can reflect students' various musical needs. In developing an open music curriculum, a music teachers should understand students' personal musical interests first before teaching music. Many cases in this research show that, at earlier stages of learning music, some were more excited when introduced other musical genres from opera, film, or theatre to popular culture; others when shown other musical media of discs, videos, or photos of various musical performances. Most of them enhanced their musical interests from various extracurricular activities of glee clubs, choirs, music bands, musical competitions, or field trips. They did music with local communities or institutions such as churches, in particular.

References

- Arasi, M. T. (2006). *Adult reflections on a high school choral music program: Perceptions of meaning and lifelong influence* (Doctoral dissertation, Georgia State University).
- Belli, R. (1998). The structure of autobiographical memory and the event history calendar: Potential improvements in the quality of retrospective reports in surveys. *Memory*, 6, 383-406.
- Brand, M. (1985). Research in music teacher effectiveness. Update: *Applications of Research in Music Education*, 3(2), 13-16.
- Brewer, W. F. (1996). What is recollective memory? In D. C. Rubin (Ed.), *Remembering our past: Studies in autobiographical memory* (pp. 19 - 66). Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.
- Cary, L. J. (1999). Unexpected stories: Life history and the limits of representation. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 5(3), 411 - 427.
- Cohen, A., & Clyburn, L. (1996). Memory for popular music in elderly and young adult listeners, *Canadian Acoustics*, 24, 30.
- Conway, M. A., & Pleydell-Pearce, C. W. (2000). The construction of autobiographical memories in the self-memory system, *Psychological Review*, 107(2), 261 - 288.
- Creech, A., & Hallam, S. (2003). Parent - teacher - pupil interactions in instrumental music tuition: a literature review. *British Journal of Music Education*, 20(01), 29-44.
- Davidson, J. W., Sloboda, J. A., & Howe, M. J. (1995). The role of parents and teachers in the success and failure of instrumental learners. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 40-44.
- Dewey, J. (1998). *Experience and education*. West Lafayette, IN: Kappa Delta Pi. (Original work published 1938)
- Gabrielsson, A. (2002). Old people's remembrance of strong experiences related to music. *Psychomusicology: A Journal of Research in Music Cognition*, 18(1 - 2), 103-122.

- Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. (2006). *Educational research: competencies for analysis and applications* (8thed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Merrill Prentice Hall.
- Hatch, J. A., & Wisniewski, R. (1995). *Life history and narrative*. London, England: Falmer Press.
- Lowe, G. (2012). Lessons for teachers: What lower secondary school students tell us about learning a musical instrument. *International Journal of Music Education*, 30(3), 227-243, Croydon, UK,
- Madsen, C. K., & Kelly, S. N. (2002). First remembrances of wanting to become a music teacher. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 50(4), 323-332.
- Rohwer, D. (2002). Lessons on lifelong learning: Senior citizens talk about motivation to return to music later in life. *South western Musician, Official Publication of the Texas Music Educators Association*, 71, 40 - 41.
- Sichivitsa, V. O. (2007). The influences of parents, teachers, peers and other factors on students' motivation in music. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 29(1), 55-68.
- Sloboda, J. A., & O'Neill, S. A. (2001). Emotions in everyday listening to music. In P. N. Juslin & J. A. Sloboda (Eds.), *Music and emotion: Theory and research* (pp. 415 - 430). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

국문초록

**평생교육의 맥락에서 음악교사가
개인의 음악적 발달에 미치는 영향**

임 은 정

이 연구는 노인들의 학령기와 학령기 이후의 음악 경험을 탐색하여, 음악 교사가 개인의 음악적 발달에 미치는 영향을 평생 교육적 맥락에서 탐구하는데 목적을 두었다. 연구 결과, 음악 교사는 학령기 개인의 음악 발달과 일반적 인성 발달에 중요한 영향을 미치며, 학령기 이후의 평생 음악 학습 과정에도 지속적인 영향을 미치는 것으로 나타났다. 따라서 본 연구는 학령기 학생들에게 음악 교사의 긍정적 영향을 형성하기 위해서 음악 교사와 학생간의 친밀한 관계를 형성하고, 학생들의 다양한 음악적 흥미와 요구를 반영한 개방적 음악 교육과정을 개발하고 적용하며, 학생들 개인의 음악적 잠재성을 개발할 수 있는 다양한 교수 방법의 개발을 제안하였다.

주제어: 음악 교사, 음악 경험, 음악적 발달, 평생 음악 교육

투고일: 11월 30일, 심사(수정): 2015년 2월 3일(2월 9일), 게재확정일: 2월 24일